

CCL032-13 DRAFT HURSTVILLE HERITAGE STUDY REVIEW - POTENTIAL HERITAGE ITEMS AND OTHER MATTERS ARISING FROM THE REVIEW

Report Author/s	Acting Manager, Strategic Development, Ms L Locke
File	11/301
Previous Reports Referenced	No
Community Strategic Plan Pillar	Social and Cultural Development
Existing Policy?	No New Policy Required? No
Financial Implications	Within Budget
Reason for Report	For Consideration

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to advise Council on the initial consultation with the residents on the potential individual heritage items nominated as part of the review and update of *Hurstville Heritage Study 1988*.

The Heritage Review report initially identified 57 new individual items (in addition to the proposed North Beverly Hills and Kemps Estate Conservation Areas).

Submissions received have been considered by the Heritage Study Working Group (HSWG). The HSWG recommends that 9 of the items be removed from the list and that the remaining items proceed to be included as heritage items in Hurstville Local Environmental Plan 2012 (this excludes the consideration of the two proposed conservation areas which are subject to separate reports in this business paper).

This report also lists the recommendations of the Heritage Review as endorsed by the HSWG in relation to items to be removed from LEP 2012 and other recommendations relating to the general management of heritage in the Hurstville LGA.

This recommendation is now forwarded to Council for its consideration.

AUTHOR RECOMMENDATION

THAT Council receive the report submitted by the Heritage Study Working Group.

THAT Council consider endorsing the recommendations of the Heritage Study Working Group as contained in this report.

REPORT DETAIL

BACKGROUND

Draft Hurstville Heritage Study Review

The Department of Planning and Infrastructure (the DP&I) required Council to complete a comprehensive review (the Review) of the heritage in Hurstville within 12 months of the gazettal of Hurstville (Comprehensive) LEP 2012 and incorporate it as an amendment to Hurstville LEP 2012. Also, the *Hurstville Heritage Study 1988*, upon which the current heritage listings are based, is nearly 25 years old and is in need of a major review. The Hurstville LEP 1994 listed approximately 140 local heritage items. The Hurstville LEP 2012 includes all heritage items in Hurstville LEP 1994 with the exception of 9 items which have been approved for demolition.

The Review is jointly funded by Hurstville City Council and the Office of Environment & Heritage under the *NSW Heritage Grants Program 2011-2013 Caring for our heritage*. The Review is being progressed in accordance with the Steps 1-20 in the *Community-based Heritage Studies: A Guide* (the Heritage Guidelines) issued by the Office of Environment & Heritage.

TIMELINE – DRAFT HURSTVILLE HERITAGE STUDY REVIEW

- 15 June 2011 – Council resolution to commence review and update of Hurstville LGA-wide Heritage Study and accept funding from Office of Environment and Heritage
- October 2011 - Hurstville Community-based Heritage Study Review commenced
- 2 November 2011 – Council resolved not to nominate any Councillors on the Heritage Study Working Group (HSWG)
- 3 November 2011 – Ad published in local newspaper for nominating community representatives on HSWG (Step 4)
- December 2011 - HSWG established, 6 meetings held till date
- 8 March 2012 – Ad published in local newspaper for local community to nominate new heritage items / areas or provide more information on old heritage items (Step 9)
- October 2012 – Draft Heritage Study Review Report prepared (Step 13)
- 7 November 2012 – Update Council Report on Community-based Heritage Study Review
- 10 November 2012 – Councillor briefing by consultant /staff on potential heritage items and areas.
- 11 December 2012 – Mayoral Minute to nominated two Councillors on the Working Group
- November to January 2013 – Consultation with owners of potential heritage items (Step 15)
- 4 and 11 December 2012 - Information Sessions for potential North Beverly Hills Heritage Conservation Area (HCA)
- 5 February 2013 – Working Group finalise potential items and HCAs (Step 16).

OVERVIEW OF DRAFT REPORT ON HURSTVILLE COMMUNITY BASED HERITAGE STUDY REVIEW

A draft report on Hurstville Community based Heritage Study Review and updated heritage listings were prepared by the Heritage Consultant in October 2012. The report comprises of two parts:

- i. A written report that provides the methodology and scope of the Study, revised historical summary and themes and recommendations.
- ii. Inventory Sheets that provide relevant data on the existing and the proposed items - Initially, a total of 57 potential items and two heritage conservations areas were proposed by the HSWG.

Report recommendation in relation to the proposed items

The Report recommends Council to prepare a Planning Proposal and an amendment to the Hurstville Local Environmental Plan 2012 in accordance with the heritage provisions of the Department of Planning and Infrastructure's Standard Instrument incorporating 48 new sites as heritage items in accordance with the recommendations of this Study Review.

Process for heritage listing

In accordance with Heritage Council guidelines the process for listing an item or area requires consideration of heritage significance in line with a range of criteria listed below:

NSW Heritage Assessment Criteria used to assess a proposed item / area

Criterion (a)

An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area);

Criterion (b)

An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area);

Criterion (c)

An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area);

Criterion (d)

An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons;

Criterion (e)

An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area);

Criterion (f)

An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area);

Criterion (g)

An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's

- cultural or natural places; or
- cultural or natural environments.
- (or a class of the local area's cultural or natural places; or
- cultural or natural environments.)

Where an item or area meets these criteria it may be considered for listing under a local environmental plan as a heritage item or conservation area. Such listing then affords the item or area protection under State heritage legislation by placing which additional requirements on any decisions regarding alterations, development or demolition.

Identification of Proposed Items

A total of 13 potential item nominations were received during the designated nomination period from both community members and the Heritage Study Working Group members. Further surveys have been undertaken to identify additional potential heritage items within the Hurstville LGA as well as review of items listed on the Heritage and Conservation Registers of RailCorp and the Sydney Water Corporation; and items identified by the National Trust of Australia (NSW) and the Australian Institute of Architects. A total of 57 individual potential heritage items were originally recommended for listing under the HLEP 2012.

The Inventory Sheets for each item are attached in the Appendix to this report.

CONSULTATION PROCESS

In accordance with the Heritage Guidelines, there are two stages for the community to comment – an early consultation stage with only the affected owners and a State endorsed public consultation stage. The subject consultation is part of the early consultation stage. A further round of public consultation for any items that Council resolved to include as heritage items will be undertaken as part of the Draft Local Environmental Plan process.

The early consultation period extended from **mid-November 2012 to 11 January 2013** and has involved the following:

Councillor Briefing

Councillors briefing on potential heritage items and areas was held as part of the Councillor Strategic Planning Workshop from 9 -11 November 2012.

Heritage Study Working Group

Established in December 2011, this included representatives from the local community, National Trust of Australia (NSW), Oatley Heritage Group, Aboriginal community groups and Council staff. The HSWG has met on six (6) occasions to date.

Communications

A dedicated page was established with relevant information available on Council's website (under <http://www.hurstville.nsw.gov.au/Hurstville-Heritage-Study-1988.html>)

Letters

A letter was sent to the owners of each individual item and invited submissions. The letter advising of the ongoing Hurstville Heritage Study Review was accompanied by:

- a Heritage Inventory Sheet for each property explaining its heritage significance; and
- a Heritage Branch publication, namely, *Heritage Listing Explained – What it means for you*.

Individual Meetings With Property Owners

Owners of proposed heritage items were invited to attend meetings at Council (with Council's heritage consultant) to discuss the proposed listing of their items.

A total of 17 meetings were held to discuss 30 the individual items, including a meeting with Council staff to discuss Council owned items.

SUBMISSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE HSWG

Council received written submissions for 29 of the proposed heritage items. As previously mentioned, Council staff and the heritage consultant also meet with 17 land owners regarding the potential items.

Following community consultation submissions were reviewed and further investigation on some items was undertaken. Of the original 57 potential item recommendations 9 individual items have been removed from consideration for listing under the HELP 2012. The remainder of the potential items (48 items) have been recommended by the HSWG for listing in the HLEP 2012.

A summary of the submissions and the recommendations of the HSWG for all the heritage items are located in Appendix 1 of this report.

Heritage Study Working Group Recommendation

The following table lists the items that are recommended to proceed towards heritage listing:

Item Name	Address	Suburb	Item Number
Regina Coeli Catholic Church, Beverly Hills	70 Ponyara Road	Beverly Hills	1810161
Hilcrest	130 Stoney Creek Road	Beverly Hills	1810148
House	134 Stoney Creek Road	Beverly Hills	1810157
Weatherboard Cottages	20 & 22 Botany Street	Carlton	1810162
Hurstville Baptist Church	4 Dora Street	Hurstville	1810165

Hurstville Oval and Velodrome	30D Dora Street	Hurstville	1810168
Hurstville Scout Troop Hall	116 Durham Street	Hurstville	1810167
Allawah Reservoir (WS 0001)	2 Forest Road	Hurstville	1810145
Shop	237 Forest Road	Hurstville	1810163
Hurstville Railway Sub-station Between	309 & 309A Forest	Hurstville	1810144
Georges River College, Hurstville Boys	Kenwyn Street	Hurstville	1810153
Inter-War Shops and Residences	61, 61A, 63, 65, 67 Kimberley	Hurstville	1810164
Hurstville Civic Centre (Hurstville Entertainment Centre)	16-32 Macmahon Street	Hurstville	1810171
Fig Tree in Binder Reserve	Regan Street	Hurstville	1810209
Convict Road	Lot 2 DP 29596 Behind 1220	Lugarno	1810199
Evatt Park	Forest Road	Lugarno	1810169
Lugarno Water Pumping Station	(Forest Road	Lugarno	1810146
Stone Shed and Ferry Wharf Slipway	Near 1220 Forest Road	Lugarno	1810170
Memorial Obelisk	Cnr. Ponderosa Place and F	Lugarno	1810159
Margretha	41 Boundary Road	Mortdale	1810198
Mortdale Memorial Gardens	65 Boundary Road	Mortdale	1810179
Electricity Substation No. 10020	31 Cook Street	Mortdale	1810149
Row of Workers Cottages	13-21 George Street	Mortdale	1810176
Mortdale Uniting Church	18 Morts Road	Mortdale	1810166
Mortdale Fire Station	38 Morts Road	Mortdale	1810173
Mortdale Hotel	1 Pitt Street	Mortdale	1810175
Row of Workers Cottages	49-55 (excluding no. 53) Pitt Street	Mortdale	1810177
Oatley Park and Baths Dame Mary	Gilmour Road	Oatley	1810191
House	25 Lloyd Street	Oatley	1810186
House	36 Lloyd Street	Oatley	1810187
George Fincham Pipe Organ	1 Myall Street	Oatley	1810182
Bangala	7 Myall Street	Oatley	1810183
Mortdale Oatley Baptist Church	1-5 Woronora Parade	Oatley	1810188
House	42 Woronora Parade	Oatley	1810185
All Saints Oatley West Anglican Church	60 Woronora Parade	Oatley	1810189

House and Pine tree	78 Woronora Parade	Oatley	1810184
Peakhurst Public School	76 Bonds Road	Peakhurst	1810192
Roslyn Gardens(Facade & Garden	764 Forest Road	Peakhurst	1810194
Fig Tree in Pickering Park	16A Isaac Street	Peakhurst	1810208
Fig Tree	Lambert Reserve, White Gat	Peakhurst Heights	1810195
House	15 Arcadia Street	Penshurst	1810197
Georges River College - Penshurst	2 Austral Street	Penshurst	1810207
St John the Evangelist's Anglican	2 Carrington Street	Penshurst	1810160
Penshurst Public School	510 Forest Rd (Cnr. Arcadia)	Penshurst	1810155
Penshurst Railway Station Group	Cnr Laycock Rd (South) & Br	Penshurst	1810151
Avenue of Trees	Penshurst Street	Penshurst	1810178
Penshurst Hotel	29 Penshurst Street	Penshurst	1810196
Salt Pan Creek Sewage Aqueduct	Clarendon Road	Riverwood	1810152

EXISTING HERITAGE ITEMS TO BE REMOVED FROM LEP 2012 AND DRAFT HURSTVILLE CITY CENTRE LEP 2012

The Report on the Heritage Study recommends the removal of the following items from Schedule 5 of the Hurstville LEP 2012 and the Draft City Centre LEP. These items are recommended to be removed from the LEPS as they have either been demolished or have been irreversibly altered.

- 112 Forest Road, Hurstville
- Mashman Avenue, Kingsgrove – Mashman Pottery and Tile Works
- 136 Forest Road, Hurstville
- 316 Forest Road, Hurstville

OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS ARISING FROM THE HERITAGE STUDY REVIEW

The Report also makes the following general recommendations in relation to the management and assessment of heritage in the Hurstville LGA

“Recommendation 4: Provide guidelines on house types in the local area with restoration and adaptation advice. Such information could be delivered both through an on-line format and through Heritage Information Brochures.

Recommendation 5: Ensure that assessment of development applications takes into account the impact of the proposed development on the heritage significance of the heritage items within the area.

Recommendation 6: That Council investigate alternative means of providing financial assistance to owners of heritage items, for example establishing a local heritage fund, with funding assistance from the Local Government Heritage Management Program.

Recommendation 7: That Council consider the commissioning of an assessment of the Aboriginal Cultural Heritage in the Hurstville LGA.

Recommendation 8: That Council make the Heritage Study Review available for public viewing as part of public exhibition of the Planning Proposal and LEP amendment and following finalisation. Hard copies should be kept at Council, an electronic copy available on Council's website, the online catalogue of the Hurstville City Library and the website of NSW Office of Environment and Heritage.

Recommendation 9: That Council investigate whether to establish a Heritage Advisory Committee and engage regular services of a heritage advisor as required.

Recommendation 10: That Council establishes a program for preparation of conservation documents for Council owned heritage properties. Concise conservation management plans or strategies for Council owned properties can be used as an example for private owners of heritage items.

Recommendation 11: That Council encourages local historical societies and individuals to prepare area histories, oral histories if required and establish liaison with other historical societies and groups in the LGA.

Recommendation 12: That Council review the adequacy of storage for the Library, Museum and Gallery section, including the Local Studies collection.

Recommendation 13: That Council investigate whether to establish a conservation and heritage award to acknowledge the works and efforts of the community, society or heritage item owners, which may encourage other heritage item owners to appreciate the values of their properties and undertake conservation works to preserve the heritage item stock in the local area.

Recommendation 14: That Council considers the ranking map of discontinued Kems Estate Conservation Area nomination when assessing any future development within the area. Those properties that had been ranked as Contributory A and Contributory B should be archivally recorded for future reference and for the documentation of the development history of Mortdale.

Recommendation 15: That Council ensure the street trees that had been nominated for listing and excluded due to the infrastructure issues be managed under Plans of Management. Assessment by suitably qualified arborist should be made prior to removal of any trees considered under the potential listing" (See Heritage Study Review Report).

NEXT STEPS

Based on the recommendations from the HSWG and submissions, this report is referred to Council for its consideration. In this regard the options are:

1. to adopt the recommendations of the HSWG;
2. to modify the recommendation of the HSWG; or
3. to resolve not to proceed with the recommendation of the HSWG.

If Council resolves to adopt all or some of the items as heritage items, the next step is include the preparation of a Planning Proposal incorporating the proposed items into the Hurstville LEP 2012. This will be forwarded to the Department of Planning & Infrastructure for issuing of a Gateway Determination allowing Council to publicly exhibit the Planning Proposal.

APPENDICES

Appendix 1	Heritage Items - Submission Summary and Recommendations
Appendix 2	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 1
Appendix 3	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Existing Items - Beverly Hills
Appendix 4	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Existing Items - Carlton
Appendix 5	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Existing Items - Hurstville
Appendix 6	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Existing Items - Lugarno
Appendix 7	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Existing Items - Mortdale
Appendix 8	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Existing Items - Oatley
Appendix 9	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Existing Items - Peakhurst
Appendix 10	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Existing Items - Penshurst
Appendix 11	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Beverly Hills
Appendix 12	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Carlton
Appendix 13	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Hurstville
Appendix 14	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Lugarno
Appendix 15	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Mortdale
Appendix 16	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Oatley
Appendix 17	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Peakhurst
Appendix 18	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Penshurst
Appendix 19	Final Draft Heritage Report - Vol 2 - Inventory Sheets - Potential Items - Riverwood

Minute No. 4

RESOLVED THAT Council receive the report submitted by the Heritage Study Working Group.

THAT Council prepare a Planning Proposal for submission to the Department of Planning and Infrastructure to amend Hurstville Local Environmental Plan 2012 by seeking to include the following heritage items:

Item Name	Address	Suburb	Item Number
Hilcrest	130 Stoney Creek Road	Beverly Hills	1810148
Weatherboard Cottages	20 & 22 Botany Street	Carlton	1810162
Hurstville Baptist Church	4 Dora Street	Hurstville	1810165
Hurstville Oval and Velodrome	30D Dora Street	Hurstville	1810168
Hurstville Scout Hall	116 Durham Street	Hurstville	1810167
Allawah Reservoir (WS 0001)	2 Forest Road	Hurstville	1810145
Shop	237 Forest Road	Hurstville	1810163
Hurstville Railway Sub-station Between	309 & 309A Forest	Hurstville	1810144
Georges River College, Hurstville Boys	Kenwyn Street	Hurstville	1810153
Fig Tree in Binder Reserve	Regan Street	Hurstville	1810209
Convict Road	Lot 2 DP 29596_Behind 1220	Lugarno	1810199
Evatt Park	Forest Road	Lugarno	1810169
Lugarno Water Pumping Station	Forest Road	Lugarno	1810146
Stone Shed and Ferry Wharf Slipway	Near 1220 Forest Road	Lugarno	1810170
Memorial Obelisk	Cnr. Ponderosa Place and Forest Rd	Lugarno	1810159
Margretha	41 Boundary Road	Mortdale	1810198
Mortdale Memorial Gardens	65 Boundary Road	Mortdale	1810179
Electricity Substation No. 10020	31 Cook Street	Mortdale	1810149
Mortdale Uniting Church	18 Morts Road	Mortdale	1810166
Mortdale Fire Station	38 Morts Road	Mortdale	1810173
Oatley Park and Baths	Dame Mary Gilmour Road	Oatley	1810191
House	36 Lloyd Street	Oatley	1810187

George Fincham Pipe Organ	1 Myall Street	Oatley	1810182
Bangala	7 Myall Street	Oatley	1810183
Peakhurst Public School	76 Bonds Road	Peakhurst	1810192
Roslyn Gardens (Facade & Garden)	764 Forest Road	Peakhurst	1810194
Fig Tree in Pickering Park	16A Isaac Street	Peakhurst	1810208
Fig Tree	Lambert Reserve, Whitegates Ave	Peakhurst Heights	1810195
House	15 Arcadia Street	Penshurst	1810197
Georges River College - Penshurst	2 Austral Street	Penshurst	1810207
St John the Evangelist's Anglican	2 Carrington Street	Penshurst	1810160
Penshurst Public School	510 Forest Rd (cnr. Arcadia)	Penshurst	1810155
Penshurst Railway Station Group	cnr Laycock Rd (South) & Bridge St	Penshurst	1810151
Penshurst Hotel	29 Penshurst Street	Penshurst	1810196
Salt Pan Creek Sewage Aqueduct	Clarendon Road	Riverwood	1810152

THAT the following items be withdrawn from the process of heritage listing:

Item Name	Address	Suburb	Item Number
Regina Coeli Catholic Church, Beverly Hills	70 Ponyara Road	Beverly Hills	1810161
Row of Workers Cottages	49 - 55 Pitt Street	Mortdale	1810177
Inter-War Shops and Residences	61, 61A, 63, 65, Kimberley	Hurstville	1810164
House	134 Stoney Creek Road	Beverly Hills	1810157
Hurstville Civic Centre (Hurstville Entertainment Centre)	16-32 MacMahon Street	Hurstville	1810171
Mortdale Hotel	1 Pitt Street	Mortdale	1810175
Inter-War Shops and Residences	67 Kimberley	Hurstville	1810164
Row of Workers Cottages	13,15-21 George Street	Mortdale	1810176
House	25 Lloyd Street	Oatley	1810186
Mortdale Oatley Baptist Church	1-5 Woronora Parade	Oatley	1810188

House	42 Woronora Parade	Oatley	1810185
All Saints Oatley West Anglican Church	60 Woronora Parade	Oatley	1810189
House and Pine tree	78 Woronora Parade	Oatley	1810184
Avenue of Trees	Penshurst Street	Penshurst	1810178

THAT Council removes the following items from Schedule 5 of the Hurstville LEP 2012 and the Draft City Centre LEP as they have either been demolished or have been irreversibly altered.

- 112 Forest Road, Hurstville
- Mashman Avenue, Kingsgrove – Mashman Pottery and Tile Works
- 136 Forest Road, Hurstville
- 316 Forest Road, Hurstville

THAT Council make the Heritage Study Review available for public viewing as part of public exhibition of the Planning Proposal and LEP amendment and following finalisation.

THAT Council investigate whether to establish a conservation and heritage award to acknowledge the works and efforts of the community, society or heritage item owners, which may encourage other heritage item owners to appreciate the values of their properties and undertake conservation works to preserve the heritage item stock in the local area.

FURTHER THAT those persons who made a submission to the initial consultation of the potential heritage listing of properties be advised of Council's decision.

(Moved Councillor P Sansom / Councillor C Hindi)

<i>For:</i>	<i>His Worship the Mayor, Councillor J Jacovou, Deputy Mayor, Councillor A Istephan, Councillor V Badalati, Councillor C Drane, Councillor C Hindi Councillor R Kastanias, Councillor N Liu, Councillor J Mining, Councillor P Sansom, Councillor D Sin, Councillor M Stevens, Councillor C Wu</i>
<i>Against:</i>	